

The Future of Intelligence
Canadian Association for Security and Intelligence Studies
Ottawa, Canada
September 28 to 30, 2000

September 28, 2000

The Future of Intelligence – New Interpretations

Bruce Berkowitz

With their tanks going at the speed of their infantry, British lost battles, because of thousands years of infantry dogma: technology alone is useless; you have to adapt it and learn to use it wisely.

We are not well-prepared to face the new threats; before, we had CCCP, static, isolated, well-identified; today, threats are more varied (disease, economy, IT, ...).

Robert Metcalfe (3COM): Internet makes opportunities to communicate information and data increase exponentially; Internet is powerful because of its operational concept letting users to use it easily.

Trying to use Internet with old means by the intelligence community is like going to war with new tanks but using old infantry techniques.

The intelligence community has to change its traditions to optimise its use of new technology.

Secrecy is the most significant barrier preventing the intelligence community to fully use the new technology.

The Future of Intelligence – New Interpretations

Adrienne Jackson

Australia is undergoing a major reform of its intelligence activities, a key output of its defence system.

It has recruitment issues, especially because new IT specialists are better-treated and more attracted by private companies.

Nationalism may become an important issue regarding Australian security (for example: East Timor)

The Future of Intelligence – New Interpretations

Christopher Andrew

The previous experience of our activities has to be a guide for the future.

“Instant opinion” is more widely seen than people actually taking a minute to stop and think.

In intelligence, success and failures are relative.

Committees recently became to be efficient, after years of adaptation.

One of the great revolution of the 20th century was the application of the committee way of doing to the private intelligence corporations.

Intelligence collection is easier, on a human level, in authoritarian states than in Unitarian states.

It is important to keep long term views in order not to screw up the present.

Looking at history tells more than looking at only a generation ago.

Covert Operations

Mel Goodman

Origins of the CIA, tactical successes and failures of covert operations.

Covert actions were seen as simple, cheap and effective.

The CIA had short-term successes but rare long-term visions.

Role of covert actions corrupt the CIA itself, the intelligence produced by the CIA, and the policy of the US government.

The CIA is a non-policy organisation; covert operations are policy actions (requested by the Security Council), so the CIA was therefore corrupted; covert operations are not information collection but means to influence movements, governments, organisations, leaders, ...

Reform of covert operations: stop them! there is no need for the CIA to undergo covert actions.

In fact, covert actions are hurting US credibility.

CIA should get back to its origins: an information collection agency of the White House (executive).

Intelligence and Ethical Foreign Policy

Michael Herman

The ethical question asked is whether intelligence makes the world better or worst (are the methods used good or bad).

Using Intelligence Wisely
Kurt Jensen

Intelligence is a tool for decision-maker.

Intelligence will be effective if the information collected are correct, well-timed, relevant (implies to understand what the client is looking for) and disseminated into the correct level of secrecy.

Intelligence Analysis, Past and Future
Ernest May

CIA=D.O. Directorate of Operations (collection), D.I. Directorate of intelligence (analysis)

Why a distinct intelligence directorate? Donovan recommended to Roswell to create such an organisation.

To fasten the process, civilians have been hired; foreign officers were strongly jealous and saw their monopoly threatened.

1947: creation of the new CIA with 2 divisions.

Economists have been first privileged among D.I.

September 29, 2000

Leaders and Intelligence
Timothy Naftali

Historical examples of relationship between intelligence and policy-making: 1943, Rome intercepts made clear that Jews were going to be deported in death camps; Churchill and Roosevelt may not have been informed, even the information has been disseminated; 1941, Pearl Harbor.

How to reach the president with intelligence information: New York Times, President Daily Brief, National Security Advisors (intelligence reports), counsellors (who were seeing the intelligence officers daily).

In the soviet system, information was coming from the chiefs of organisations: no other filters or discrimination; in the soviet system, there was a lot of information but not much knowledge (not much analysis).

Remarkable sources; US, tapes by J. Kennedy of his meeting with chiefs of intelligence; both about activities and inputs (what they were doing and what was the result in terms of intelligence); these tapes revealed what Kennedy was thinking when taking decisions (where

usually, decision-makers never write down or record their thoughts); transcriptions of these tapes are not all available because M. Naftali's team has to work 90 minutes to understand one unintelligible minute of discussion.

Soviet: the raw data was going directly to the "top", to the president.

Global Issues
Greg Fyffe

Globalisation makes intelligence assessments harder to produce with relevancy.

Globalisation means the change of sources intelligence communities are going to rely on for assessments.

Do we pay enough attention on global issues?

Assessments organisations are called upon co-operation with police forces, natural environment agencies, etc.

Economic assessments are more and more important, especially because of the strong link between economy and policy-making.

Assessments agencies need to understand global issues and also to restrict their definition of intelligence in order not to do other's people job.

"Think globally, assess globally".

On Intelligence: Reconstruction and Globalization
Robert Davis Steele

Governments are using 2% of the available information.

The private sector can serve the intelligence agencies by accessing, filtering and disseminating the information.

In the Us, the system is in chaos: agencies don't work together.

Secret worldfare (1st era), analysis (2nd era), public as a consistency (3rd era).

"We've become stupid": we need to get a smarter population, especially with distance learning.

With the same money, you can buy a full battle ship or disseminate water (first one can make war, that cost 100 million\$ a day, second one can prevent a war).

Proposal: Canada must create a global intelligence portal (web-based), available to intelligence analysts and decision-makers.

The Mitrokhin Archive
Christopher Andrew

The Mitrokhin Archive (book: the Mitrokhin File).

Shows how different were visions of the KGB by the West world countries and an “insider”.

The Media and the Future
Joe Scanlon

Utility of the media for intelligence community: alternative view of events and provide contact with the public.

The Media and the Future
Jim Bronskill

Intelligence agencies have great power that media agencies don't.

Intelligence bodies don't share or disseminate much.

The Media and the Future
Jim Littleton

It's not unusual for intelligence agencies to try to recruit journalists who are making information collection their job, and having a lot of contacts).

The relationship (journalist/intelligence agencies) is very attractive but has risks: journalists are not as discreet as intelligence agents could be.

This relationship is usually more attractive for the intelligence agencies than for the journalists, because journalists are risking their credibility, their job, their security; overall, journalists need their independence.

The Media and the Future
Stewart Bell

Editors love intelligence and security issues: they are easy sell.

There are different standards when it comes to reporting intelligence and security issues (sources kept secret, ...).

Politicians seem to display blindness over these issues.

Reporting on these issues can be a nasty business.

Press and intelligence have that in common that they both have employees with similar background, they collect information.

The Media and the Future
Andrew Mitrovica

Press in Canada is the only intelligence agency that is accountable before the public.

The Future of HUMINT
Fred Hitz

Human source intelligence: HUMINT.

75%-80% of information on terrorism and WMDs come from HUMINT and SIGINT.

US intelligence: problem to overcome: it has to learn how to play in its own arena.

HUMINT can be used for economic intelligence as well as industrial espionage; the first one is preventive, the later is inappropriate and ineffective.

HUMINT can be used for counterintelligence.

Smaller, more specialised, better-trained foreign agents should be within US CIA HUMINT.

The Future of Canadian HUMINT
Alistair Hensler

HUMINT= clandestine collection; non clandestine HUMINT= open sources in symposiums, etc.

HUMINT: main source of intelligence, despite the increasing use of new telecommunication technology.

McDonald commission recognised the role of HUMINT in intelligence agencies: it exists and will always exist.

HUMINT can play a key role when it comes to facing cyber threat to intelligence and the terrorist groups that are becoming smaller.

Now that technology can help offences to be perpetrated from outside Canada, HUMINT can be used to counter this new threat.

Suggestion: let's have a foreign intelligence service (s. 16 CSIS Act helping...).

A foreign HUMINT could prevent economic threats and help security intelligence with cyber threats from abroad.

NSA in the 21st Century
Matthew Aid

More telephone lines in New York City than in Africa: the new telecommunication technology doesn't "affect" the whole world.

For SIGINT collectors, developing countries are the main targets; developed countries are not that much targeted.

70% of the countries depend on COMSAT or TELSAT.

September 30, 2000

Future Directions in Europe, Russia and Western Europe
Amy Knight

There is a great evidence of a resurgence of the old Soviet regime.

Putin, former head of KGB (in KGB for 16 years), doesn't seem to be willing to improve links with the West.

Putin wants to use the security services to keep control, like in the old Soviet systems.

FSB: Federal Security Service, mainly directed by the "St. Petersburg Mafia".

New legislation will enter into force and give more power to intelligence agencies.

New security and intelligence dogma entered into force recently, restricting independence and freedom of the Russian press.

Russian government and military authorities under Putin are showing hostile attitude toward the West (for example: Kursk affair).

Foreign intelligence service: SVR (Putin put there many of his friends...).

KGB days seem to be back under Putin government.

West: we must reassess our policy toward Russian intelligence activities.

As long as former KGB will remain within the Russian authorities, the old Soviet system will still be in the background.

Future Directions in Europe, Russia and Western Europe

Peter Jones

1991: the creation of a European agency for peacekeeping, peace making and rescue operations was discussed in Peterborough, Germany.

No concrete steps have been taken to constitute such a European force, until 1999.

Divergences between EU members make the European force difficult to create but a lot of capital has been put in, making us think that the EU force will soon emerge.

The EU force won't be a distinct military force but instead, states will make available parts of their own troops to participate in EU Force's missions on request.

The EU Force should be able to act without the help of NATO (French view) but the EU Force should be allowed to ask for NATO resources when needed (British view).

Slowly but surely, the EU is giving itself intelligence gathering and assessment capabilities.

There is a Satellite Centre collecting images bought from different agencies around the world, including Canada (RADARSAT).

Intelligence Section and Situation Centre.

Canada supports EU Force creation but has concerns: NATO must remain #1 and EU Force must be a complement; EU Force may not act as a beside player, taking decisions contrary to NATO, US or Canadian views.

The Future in a Canadian Mirror

Reg Whitaker

There is a dark side of globalisation, which should be a concern for intelligence community.

Alliance, partnership and virtual intelligence activity should increase.

NGOs may be the most important sources of intelligence: that is to be taken into account.

We are not talking about technology of collection: the problem is to deal with the tremendous amount of information; HUMINT should be privileged.

Consumer-driven or analyst-driven intelligence, or collection-driven intelligence.

The problem is that, often, consumers (governments) don't know what they want.

More entrepreneurial mind from analysts.

The Future in a Canadian Mirror
Greg Fyffe

New IT developments are speeding ahead of the speed of speculation.

The Future in a Canadian Mirror
Stuart Farson

There is a major paradigm shift.

Canadian authorities and elite don't consider intelligence enough.

On campus, there is a great and undeniable interest among students for intelligence courses: we can however ask ourselves if it had any effect and any positive effect on the intelligence community.

The anglo-saxon model of intelligence, now very bureaucratized and focused on enemy states, is still needed today but needs to be adapted to new realities.

National concerns of yesterday versus global concerns of today.

The Future in a Canadian Mirror
George Kolisnek

We today have tremendous quantity of information but we have so little knowledge (consequence of the emergence of the virtual world).

We have to be aware of and pay attention to what media are presenting: we must be critical, we need to debate, we need to communicate.

We need to start focusing on doing instead of keeping debating on what to do (debating has already been done).